

THAMESLINK 2000

Proof of Evidence on Borough High Street Conservation Area Replacement Buildings

By
Tom Jestico

NR/5/A1

Town and Country Planning Act 1990
Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990
Transport and Works Act 1992

Railtrack (Thameslink 2000) Order 1997
Railtrack (Thameslink 2000) (Variation) Order 1999

1. Inquiry into applications by Network Rail for the Thameslink 2000 railway project sites at

11-15 Borough High Street, London SE1
2-4 Bedale Street, London SE1
7 Stoney Street, London SE1
16-26 Borough High Street and 7 Bedale Street, London SE1
Blackfriars Railway Bridge, London EC4
Blackfriars Station North, London EC4
Blackfriars Railway Bridge, London SE1 (includes proposed south bank station entrance)

2. Re-opened inquiry into applications made by Railtrack plc for orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992 and associated applications.

CONTENTS

1.0	QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE	3
2.0	INTRODUCTION	5
3.0	SCOPE OF EVIDENCE	7
4.0	11-15 BOROUGH HIGH STREET	9
4.1	Existing Buildings	9
4.2	The Proposed Replacement Building	11
4.3	Siting	11
4.4	Site Context	12
4.5	Accommodation	14
4.6	Environmental Factors	15
4.7	External Cladding	15
4.8	External Design	16
4.9	Summary	18
5.0	16-26 BOROUGH HIGH STREET	19
5.1	The Existing Buildings	19
5.2	The Effect of the Railway Viaduct and Bridge	21
5.3	The Proposed Replacement Building – The Retail and Office Building.	22
5.4	Site Context	23
5.5	Siting	23
5.6	Accommodation	24
5.7	Environmental Factors	25
5.8	External Cladding	25
5.9	External Design	26
5.10	Summary	28
5.11	The alternative Replacement Building – The Market Hall option	28
5.12	Siting	29
5.13	Site Context	30
5.14	Accommodation	31
5.15	Environmental Factors	31
5.16	External Cladding	32

5.17 External Design	33
5.19 Planning Application	34
6.0 2-4 BEDALE STREET	35
6.1 Existing Building	35
6.2 The Proposed Replacement building	36
6.3 Siting	37
6.4 Site Context	38
6.5 Accommodation	39
6.6 Environmental Factors	40
6.7 External Design	40
6.8 Summary	43
7.0 7 STONEY STREET SEI	44
7.1 Existing Buildings	44
7.2 The Proposed Replacement	45
7.3 Summary	46
8.0 OVERVIEW	48
8.1 The Urban Context	48
8.2 Our Approach	49
8.3 Our proposals	49

APPENDICES [NR/5/B]

Appendix 1 – Photographs of Previous Projects

Appendix 2 – Photographs of Borough High Street Conservation Area

I.0 QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE

- I.1 My name is Tom Jestico. I am an architect and a consultant to Jestico + Whiles, architects. I was a director of the firm from its inception in 1978 to July 2003. The practice consists of around 80 employees and has an established reputation for sensitive contemporary architectural design within historic urban areas.
- I.2 Before founding the practice in 1978 I was employed by Farrell Grimshaw Architects, where I was an Associate for five years. Prior to that I worked for national and international architects in Cambridge and London. These included George Vickers in Cambridge, specialising in the refurbishment of historic buildings, Castle Park Dean and Hooke (an Oxford library) and YRM International (University buildings).
- I.3 I am an advisor to the Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment and a Council member of the Association of Consultant Architects. I am a registered architect and member of the RIBA.
- I.4 As a director of Jestico + Whiles I have worked on and been responsible for a number of transport related projects and projects in Conservation Areas. These include:
- a. Craven Street, London W1, 1989. The refurbishment and conservation of a complete terrace of Grade II listed Georgian houses into offices and residential units. The work included a new replacement building in the style of the adjacent properties [photograph 1 Appendix I NR/5/B].
 - b. Equitable House, City of London, 1998. A new six-storey office building, clad in Portland stone, in a Conservation Area adjacent to The Monument (Grade I listed). Copper Development Award 1999 [photograph 2 Appendix I NR/5/B].
 - c. Marylebone High Street London W1, 2004-2005. Conversion of a music school into residential units in a Conservation Area, including a

contemporary infill in Blandford Street [photograph 3 Appendix I NR/5/B].

- d. Foundling Museum, Bloomsbury, 2004. Refurbishment, extension and interior work to Grade II listed building [photograph 4 Appendix I NR/5/B].

2.0 INTRODUCTION

2.1 Jestico + Whiles were appointed in 2002 by Skanska to develop designs for the sites and buildings affected by the Thameslink 2000 viaduct and bridge proposals in the Borough High Street and Borough Market area. The designs were to be developed to RIBA stage C/D, and to be suitable for multiple planning applications.

2.2 We worked alongside the contractor, Skanska, and other members of a multi-disciplinary team at Thameslink 2000's offices in Blackfriars Road.

2.3 Thameslink 2000 required that the designs for replacement buildings in the Borough Market Area should conform to the Thameslink 2000 Inquiry Inspector's recommendations to the OPDM and, in particular,

“in order to properly protect the character of Conservation Areas at Borough High Street and Blackfriars I have concluded that there should be special arrangements ensuring that where buildings of townscape value are to be demolished to make way for the works, reinstatement should be secured before the Thameslink 2000 Order and any permissions and consents associated with the demolitions are issued (Thameslink 2000 Addendum Report [CD/200]).”

2.4 The Secretary of State endorsed the Inspector's view in his letter of 29 January 2003 [CD/204] stating that it would be inappropriate to make a TWA order and grant other consents without having before him details of the replacement buildings proposed in the Borough High Street Conservation Area and at other sites.

2.5 Consultation meetings were held with the Borough Market Trustees, Southwark Cathedral, English Heritage, the Post Office and owners of the former St. Thomas Hospital building, and LB Southwark.

2.6 Designs were produced to RIBA work stage D 'Scheme Design' standards and took account of the Building Regulations, particularly with regard to means of escape in case of fire and unprotected areas in facades adjacent to

other properties. They also met the requirements of Part M, access for the disabled. Care was taken to ensure that the buildings could be erected and demolished without imposing loads on or affecting the stability of the viaduct / bridge structure and neighbouring properties.

- 2.7 This proof of evidence is subdivided into sections which deal with each of the four sites in turn - 11 to 15 Borough High Street, 16 to 26 Borough High Street, 2 to 4 Bedale Street and 7 Stoney Street.

3.0 SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

3.1 My evidence describes and explains the architectural designs produced by my firm under my direction for the replacement buildings at:

- a. 11-15 Borough High Street, SE1
- b. 16-26 Borough High street and 7 Bedale Street, SE1
- c. 2-4 Bedale Street, SE1
- d. 7 Stoney Street SE1

3.2 It records the rationale of each design and explains their contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Statement of Matters

3.3 In particular, my evidence will address, with the respect to the design of the new buildings, the statement of matters referred to in the Statement of Matters [CD/ 176] namely:

“Applications for TWA order and deemed planning permission (ref. No’s TL27 and TL28).”

and:

“The four planning applications relating to development in the Borough High Street area, at:

7 Stoney Street SE1 (TL3)

2-4 Bedale Street SE1 (TL4)

11-15 Borough High Street SE1 (TL5)

16-26 Borough High Street and 7 Bedale Street SE1 (TL9)

- I The extent to which the development proposed in the applications would secure a high quality design having regard to the general advice in Annex A to PPG1 – General Policy and Principles (or any replacement for that guidance), current advice on good design practice and, in particular, whether the design of the proposed replacement buildings would be appropriate in their important townscape setting.

2 The extent to which the proposed development is consistent with advice in PPG15 Planning and the Historic Environment, with regard to:

- i) The desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses;
- ii) The desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the Borough High Street Conservation Area;
- iii) The need for the scale and type of development proposed.”

3.4 Since the issue by the Secretaries of State of the Statement of Matters [CD/176], PPS1 [CD/149] has superseded PPG15 [CD/7]. I have also taken note of the guidance contained in ‘By Design: Urban Design in the planning system’[CD/ 236].

4.0 11-15 BOROUGH HIGH STREET

4.1 Existing Buildings

4.1.1 The three properties affected by the new bridge to be built over Borough High Street are four-storey Victorian structures comprising retail uses at street level with small office and residential uses over. They are not listed but recorded by LB Southwark in the Borough High Street Conservation Area Appraisal dated July 2003 (the Appraisal [CD/235]) in figure 41, page 40, as making a positive contribution to the Conservation Area. There is no explanatory text to support this view and I consider that their particular contribution to the Conservation Area is, when viewed from the south, to maintain the relatively narrow and enclosed nature of Borough High Street right up to the existing bridge. See photograph I [Appendix I NR/5/B], and drawing BM 36.

4.1.2 The buildings mark the corner between Borough High Street and London Bridge Street but are unremarkable buildings in their own right. They are typical of many late-Victorian buildings that line inner London streets, with narrow frontage shops and offices over. The Inspector at the first inquiry stated that no's 11-15 Borough High Street are:

“undistinguished buildings and although providing the enclosure which I recognise as important hide from view the far more distinguished and dignified northern frontage of the listed Grade II Post Office building” [CD/199 10.6.26].

4.1.3 I consider that a sense of enclosure at this point is a valuable characteristic of the Conservation Area and that it would be considerably weakened if these buildings did not exist. Their presence outweighs the advantage of gaining views of the northern façade of the Post Office that would pertain if no's 11-15 did not exist. The Conservation Area is characterised by glimpses and oblique views of buildings through narrow openings and no's 11-15 maintain this quality.

- 4.1.4 We examined the potential for an open space considered by the Inspector in his July 2002 [CD/199] report but this option was felt to have significant drawbacks and so has not been pursued.
- 4.1.5 The drawbacks of providing an open space, either a garden or hard standing public area were considered to be as follows:
- a. It will expose the flank wall of 4 London Bridge Street which will require rendering providing the usual visual appearance of a demolished or derelict site – visually unattractive.
 - b. The flank wall weakened by the demolished buildings will require buttressing.
 - c. An open space will provide views of the architectural features of the buildings in London Bridge Street and St. Thomas Street. However it will also expose to public view such features as fire escapes, ventilation plant and ducting, pipes, dilapidated elevations of neighbouring properties etc, which will be visually undesirable.
 - d. Open space will be an invitation for unauthorised access to the rear of private properties creating problems of security.
 - e. Having removed a buffer building the properties to the rear of the site will be subject to increase road traffic noise (for example the rear suites of the London Bridge Hotel).
 - f. The local community will lose employment opportunities.
- 4.1.6 I agree with the views expressed concerning the quality of space that would result were there to be no replacement building, and endorse the preference for a replacement building on this site.

4.2 The Proposed Replacement Building

4.2.1 Railtrack's requirements for the replacement building on this site, following the inquiry Inspector's report [CD/199], were that it should accommodate mixed / office use and be built to the same frontage line as the adjacent Grade II listed building partially used as a post office. The building should be designed in width and height so as to provide as much lettable space as is practicable. The width of the building, however, should take account of two other factors:

- a. It should be separated sufficiently from the adjacent building so as to permit improved views of the side of the listed post office building
- b. It should not be separated from the adjacent building to a distance that permits the visually unattractive clutter of fire escapes, ventilation equipment etc at the rear of buildings in London Bridge Street to be visible from Borough High Street.

4.3 Siting

4.3.1 See site plan, drawing BM22, Existing Ground floor plan, drawing BM23 and existing elevations, drawing BM24. The new Borough High Street Bridge will be an imposing structure of 70m clear span with an exposed steel bowstring truss clashing with the corner of 11-15 Borough High Street by 10-12m along the Borough High Street frontage and 8-9m along London Bridge Street. Apart from the volume that the bridge will occupy, the need to demolish these buildings also arises from the requirement to obtain a clear working area in order to slew the bridge into position.

4.3.2 This part of the Conservation Area will be substantially altered by the presence of the new bridge. It will visually terminate the High Street just north of St. Thomas Street and leave little of no's 16-26 on the west side of the street. We therefore took the view that, as setting back the replacement building was unavoidable, there was an opportunity to widen the public pavement by 7m and to align its frontage with the adjacent Grade

II listed Post Office (formally part of St Thomas Hospital). As importantly, the scheme would introduce a new public place at this end of Borough High Street.

4.3.3 Borough High Street starts to rise towards London Bridge Station at this end of the High Street, turning into London Bridge Street and Railway Approach. The steps in front of the replacement building will rise half a metre, creating a pedestrian-friendly space immediately in front of the building, raised above the general level of passing traffic.

4.3.4 The Inspector at the first inquiry was less certain that a replacement building could be built on this site at all. [CD/199 10.6.26] His view was that No's. 11-15 Borough High Street are "undistinguished buildings" but that a reinstatement building "would be difficult to carry out successfully due to the shortened frontage" and suggested that consideration be given to balance this against "the exposure of the northern frontage of the Grade II Post Office building to wider public view, providing the open frontage was carefully treated". (10.6.26)

4.3.5 We took the view that a replacement building, set back to align with the Borough High Street frontage of the Post Office, would improve views of the northern façade of this building, whilst maintaining a sense of enclosure signalling the termination of Borough High Street. Further it would continue to conceal views of the unattractive rear facades of the buildings fronting London Bridge Street. See Site Context drawings BM25.

4.4 Site Context

4.4.1 There might be the opportunity to extend this raised pedestrian space in front of the post office to establish a 36m x 8m 'piazza' and to improve the unattractive entrance arrangement into the post office itself. [photograph 3 Appendix 2 NR/5/B] However, this does not form part of the proposals as

it lies outside the site boundary. Existing arrangements will continue until and unless this additional work is implemented.

- 4.4.2 A beneficial aspect of the proposed design is to improve the visibility of the north façade of the former St. Thomas Hospital. The south façade of the replacement building will be set back from the boundary line by 1.2m. (See drawing BM27). This will open up views into the courtyard behind and reveal the 'hidden' façade of this grade II listed Post Office building.
- 4.4.3 Resolution of the unsightly entrance into the Post Office would also realise the potential for improved public access and views into this courtyard. Subject to Listed Building consent, the entrance to the Post Office could be relocated centrally in the flank wall of the building; pavement levels would align with the internal floor level of the Post Office.
- 4.4.4 The cumulative result would be that the quality of the space between nos 11-15 Borough High Street and the Post Office would be enhanced and greater presence would be given for the Post Office entrance. Access for mobility-impaired persons would also be markedly improved by raising pavement levels externally.

4.5 Accommodation

- 4.5.1 The proposed building will consist of ground and basement floors with A1/A3 uses and three upper floors of B1 office use. The main body of the building will be symmetrically arranged with three structural bays facing onto Borough High Street.
- 4.5.2 The entrance to the offices will be set back on the north side of the building below a serrated façade to the offices over. See drawing BM27.
- 4.5.3 The basement and ground floors will contain approx. 430sq.m. of net floor area. The basement extends to the site boundary along Borough High Street. See drawing BM26. An open stair and platform lift for the mobility-impaired will connect the lower floor with the ground floor.
- 4.5.4 The ground and basement levels will be suitable for bookshop / café / media and other retailers. There will be an opportunity for outside seating and café uses in front of the building at ground floor level.
- 4.5.5 The upper office floors will comprise approx. 165sq.m. per floor (total 495sq.m.). The offices will be finished to a high quality Cat.A specification with raised floors, suspended ceilings and lighting, in accordance with the British Council for Offices specification. See drawing BM28.
- 4.5.6 Plant will be located at roof level and the offices will be served by a single staircase and lift. See drawing BM29. A 1.5m high parapet wall will conceal the plant from view and provide edge protection for maintenance operations. A window cleaning cradle will be permanently stored on the roof, but parked at the rear of the building. See section drawing BM34 and section drawing BM35.

4.6 Environmental Factors

- 4.6.1 The building will face northwest. The proximity of the bridge and the viaduct opposite means that excessive solar gain will be greatly alleviated by shading from these structures.
- 4.6.2 However, I believe that noise from passing trains and traffic noise from Borough High Street will require a relatively solid building with high density cladding and limited window openings to provide the acoustic protection required.
- 4.6.3 The building will be environmentally sealed with comfort-cooling and mechanical ventilation to a high standard.
- 4.6.4 Pavement glazing, set into the forecourt surface, will provide some daylight to the basement floor and will satisfy smoke ventilation requirements in the event of fire.

4.7 External Cladding

- 4.7.1 The building will be clad in oolitic limestone with zinc cladding to projecting fins and window enclosures. Curtain walling to the offices allows partitioning at 1.5m centres, in accordance with the British Council for Offices recommendations.
- 4.7.2 The shopfronts and signage will be completed by the tenant to his own requirements in accordance with normal practice. However, an indicative design is shown on the drawings.
- 4.7.3 See elevation drawings BM30, BM31, BM32 and BM33.

4.8 External Design

- 4.8.1 The overall design of the building acknowledges the presence of the Grade II listed Post Office building adjacent and seeks to play a subordinate role in the immediate townscape setting. The listing [See NR/9/B] refers to the late-Georgian style of the 1842-4 former ward block of St. Thomas's Hospital, designed by Samuel Robinson and James Field. It describes the elevation to Borough High Street with a blind window, the rusticated ground floor and the two upper floors with sash windows, moulded architraves, and cornice being articulated by a giant order of Doric pilasters surmounted by an entablature and raised central parapet. In accordance with the guidance given in PPG15 (paragraph 3.5 [CD/7]) the replacement building will be broadly similar in height to the building it replaces and its vertical emphasis will be complementary to the neighbouring Post Office.
- 4.8.2 Nevertheless, it will have its own character and will make references to adjacent buildings. The predominant facing material will be limestone – similar to the Portland limestone on the St Thomas Hospital Building, but from oolitic beds, where the stone is more highly figured. Joints between stone panels will be expressed. The naturally patinated zinc, which will be used for the fins and window enclosures, is a soft, non-reflective material which ages gracefully to a matt lead colour.
- 4.8.3 The building will have a 'stripped' neo-classical appearance with a vestigial projecting cornice at roof level. It will complement the hospital but will not compete with it. See photomontage BM37.
- 4.8.4 I referred previously to the imposing nature of the new bridge structure. This will clearly dominate the street scene and I am content that what is needed in this particular location is a quiet, well-mannered building which forms a background to the bridge structure and sits calmly alongside the Post Office building.

4.8.5 In a letter dated 20 January 2004 [CD/206] to the Government Office for London, LB Southwark stated that it “recommends that planning permission is granted” for this development.

4.8.6 LB Southwark considered this application again in 2005 when, in his report to the Planning Committee held on 8 February 2005 [CD/237], the planning officer reported that:

“8.8 Townscape / Conservation Issues

The proposed building is considered to be a good quality design which could be considered to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Borough High Street conservation (sic) using stone and brick materials. The general size and bulk is constant (sic) with other buildings in the vicinity.....” and

“8.9 Impact on Amenity of Adjoining Occupiers

There are no residential occupiers in the vicinity of this site so the proposal will not have any adverse impact on residential amenity. The proposed building has a similar degree of site coverage to the existing buildings and will not be noticeably higher so it is not felt that the new building will inhibit the use of the surrounding buildings.”

4.8.7 Representations were heard from an objector and the ward councillor and it was unfortunately resolved “that were the council able to determine this application planning permission would be refused on the grounds of failure to preserve or enhance the Conservation Area” (minutes of meeting, paragraph 1.2 [CD/237]).

4.9 Summary

- 4.9.1 I believe our design achieves the urban objectives required in PPG15 [CD/7] paragraphs 2.14, 2.17, 4.16 and 4.20 and PPSI [CD/149] in paragraph 35. It preserves the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and it also achieves the objectives of Urban Design as outlined in Section 2 of 'By Design'[CD/236].
- 4.9.2 The mixed uses of offices and retail will replace existing similar uses but in a modern context, and contribute to the lively nature of the Conservation Area. In accordance with PPSI [CD/149] the new building will be integrated into the existing urban form and provide a worthwhile improvement to the public realm – a raised public plaza.
- 4.9.3 The design has been prepared in direct response to the needs of the local context and reinforces the distinctiveness of this part of Borough High Street. It will be in keeping with the urban grain referred to in PPG15 [CD/7] and will respect the setting of a listed building, the Post Office.

5.0 16-26 BOROUGH HIGH STREET

5.1 The Existing Buildings

5.1.1 These Grade II listed buildings were designed by the notable classical architect Robert Smirke and completed in 1832. Much of his work was to re-face older buildings at the rear, of which some parts still remain. They are four storeys high and consist of A1/A2/A3 uses at ground floor level with offices over. They are of brick construction with painted rendered window surrounds, string courses, mouldings and copings. The ground floor shopfronts have been extensively modified over the years but many of the original features on the upper floors remain. See drawing BHS(A)16.

5.1.2 The terrace formed part of a largely unexecuted scheme for a new approach to London Bridge. It has previously been affected by major railway works. The bridge over Borough High Street (c.1864) entailed the demolition of the northern part of the terrace and the remaining part is architecturally diminished as a result [NR/9/B].

5.1.3 As a group, no's 16-26 Borough High Street still contribute positively to the Conservation Area by virtue of their mass and restrained detailing at upper levels. However, the ground floor shops have been extensively altered and detract from its architectural quality. The Inspector, in his report acknowledged the loss of the Smirke terrace as being "by definition, harmful" [CD/199 10.6.24]. He was in favour of a substantial replacement building which retained a reduced sense of enclosure and dismissed the view that there would be a benefit in opening views of the Cathedral from Borough High Street. I agree with the Inspector's views.

5.1.4 The contribution this group of buildings makes to the Conservation Area is acknowledged in the Appraisal [CD/235] in paragraph. 3.2.1 which states that:

“it has many of the key characteristics of building (sic) on Borough High Street in its four storey height, unbroken parapet and roof line, and subtle modulation of facades.”

5.1.5 The listing [See NR/9/B] for 16-26 Borough High Street states that these properties were part of a largely unexecuted scheme for a new approach to the rebuilt London Bridge. No’s 2, 4 and 6 Green Dragon Court, at the rear, are included in the listing. It acknowledges the demolition of the northern section of the terrace and draws attention to the strongly geometric Greek Revival manner of the remaining composition. 19th century remnants of ground floor shop fronts are recorded, as is the return façade to Bedale Street and the brick elevation to Green Dragon Court in a plain manner, obscuring 17th century remains. The interior was not inspected. See photograph 6 in Appendix 2 and elevations on drawings BHS(A)3 and BHS(A)4.

5.1.6 It is in my view, impracticable to retain the existing buildings. A report was commissioned in July 2005 by Network Rail to investigate the practicality of retaining the existing façade or rebuilding the façade. Skanska’s draft report concluded that either option was technically feasible but both would incur significant cost and programme implications.

5.1.7 In my view the prolongation of the programme, additional disruption, costs, hazards and risks associated with either option outweigh the benefits of retention of only no’s 24 and 26 Borough High Street. Smirke’s original scheme would be reduced to a tiny fragment of what was originally proposed and the contribution that the resultant façade would make to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area would be diminished to the point that it would be a negative one.

5.1.8 'Facadism' is generally discouraged by English Heritage and I share their views.

5.1.9 There is an opportunity to construct a twenty-first century building on this site which will fulfil the objectives of preserving and enhancing the character and appearance of the Conservation Area to a greater extent than the retention or rebuilding of part of a Grade II listed building can provide.

5.2 The Effect of the Railway Viaduct and Bridge

5.2.1 The proposed viaduct will entail the total demolition of no's 16-26 Borough High Street to accommodate the viaduct and bridge and in order to create a working area for their construction.

5.2.2 The new viaduct will occupy a volume of over two thirds of the existing buildings at 16-26 Borough High Street, leaving a potential volume of one-third of the buildings standing. It will entail demolition of half the existing High Street frontage (Approx. 19m in length).

5.2.3 Apart from the area the new viaduct will physically occupy upon completion, there is the need to create working space for the construction of the piled foundations, the supporting columns and the viaduct structure itself. The bridge also needs a working area in order to be able to slew it into position. See drawing BHS(A)2.

5.3 The Proposed Replacement Building – The Retail and Office Building.

- 5.3.1 Thameslink 2000's requirements for the replacement building were that it should accommodate mixed retail and office use and should be constructed within the boundary of the existing 16-26 Borough High Street structure and to a height to provide the maximum lettable space consistent with the requirements to provide a solution consistent with the requirements for it to be exceptional. The site requires a building roughly triangular in plan with retail on the ground floor which addresses all three streets: Borough High Street, Bedale Street and Green Dragon Court to the rear. The rear part of the retail underneath the new viaduct should be double-height. Discussions with the LB Southwark and English Heritage have referred to the possibility of providing an access pathway between Borough High Street and the Borough Market to the side and rear of the new building. This would be partially on the site of 16 – 26 Borough High Street and partially on existing land owned by the Trustees of the Borough Market. Consideration will have to be given to sources of funding of the construction and ongoing maintenance of any such pathway.
- 5.3.2 The proposed replacement building will be constructed after the existing buildings have been demolished and the new viaduct has been erected. It will be structurally independent of the viaduct and thus it is sited clear of the pile caps supporting the viaduct and bridge supports.
- 5.3.3 The building will comprise A1/A3 retail uses at basement and ground floor level and B1 offices at 1st, 2nd and 3rd floors over. The entrance to the offices will be located on Borough High Street. New public open spaces and a new route from London Bridge Station to Green Dragon Court, Southwark Cathedral and Borough Market will be opened up to the north of the building. See drawing BHS(A)5.

5.4 Site Context

- 5.4.1 The site's immediate context is the dominant mass of the existing bridge abutments to the north [photograph 1, Appendix B, NR/5/B] the existing viaduct above Green Dragon Court [photograph 6, Appendix 2, NR/5/B] and the decorated Victorian offices at 2 Southwark Street [photograph 7, Appendix 2, NR/5/B].
- 5.4.2 The new viaduct structure will pass over Bedale Street, in front of The Globe and extend over Borough High Street. The primary urban functions of the replacement building will be to maintain a built presence on this corner and to meet the objectives described in the Inspector's report, [CD/199] paragraph 10.6.24, namely "to shield the area behind from traffic noise and retain a sense of enclosure in this part of Borough High Street".
- 5.4.3 The new building will achieve this. Its street frontage will be approximately the same height as the existing listed buildings and the curved corner at the Bedale Street / Borough High Street junction will be of equal if not superior quality to the rounded corner of the existing building at no. 26, noted in the Appraisal [CD/235] as being "well-detailed" (paragraph. 4.3.7).

5.5 Siting

- 5.5.1 The viaduct will run behind the proposed replacement building resulting in a triangular footprint site on the corner of Bedale Street and Borough High Street. By tucking the ground and first floors of a new building under the viaduct, a decent sized retail outlet can be created, comprising approx. 284sq.m at ground floor level and a further 245sq.m. at basement level. (Total 529sq.m). This will appeal to a wide range of A1/A3 users and could be subdivided if necessary. Access is possible from all sides of the new building.

5.5.2 The rear wall of the building will be curved, picking up a new route from Borough High Street to Bedale Street, the Borough Market and the Southwark Cathedral precincts. The public realm will undoubtedly be improved by these provisions as the development will create covered pedestrian places and lively uses at street level.

5.6 Accommodation

5.6.1 The ground and basement floors will contain approx. 530sq.m.of net floor area. The unit could be subdivided but as shown would be attractive to bookshop / café / media retailers. See drawings BHS(A)6 and BHS(A)10.

5.6.2 Part of the external area to the north west of the unit will be under cover from the viaduct above and would be suitable for street café use. It is within the curtilage of the existing site boundaries.

5.6.3 The office's entrance will be prominently located on Borough High Street. A single lift and stair will serve the upper floors with three frameless glass bay windows marking the lobby on each floor. The total net office floor area will be approximately 517sq.m. of which the largest floor will be at 1st floor level (285sq.m.). This floor receives daylight from all four sides. See drawing BHS(A)6. The 2nd and 3rd floors will be the same size as each other (116sq.m.) and triangular in plan form. The rear wall will be of solid construction, with glass lenses set into the wall, to alleviate noise from passing trains and to maintain privacy for office users. See drawings BHS(A)7 and BHS(A)8.

5.6.4 The offices will be suitable for small local businesses and could be occupied on a floor-by-floor basis. Due to their close proximity to the railway and Borough High Street traffic, they will be constructed to a high specification with mechanical ventilation, comfort cooling, raised floors, etc. to the British Council for Offices specification.

- 5.6.5 Plant will be located at roof level and a high parapet wall with projecting soffit will conceal this from street level views. See drawings BHS(A)9 and BHS(A)14.

5.7 Environmental Factors

- 5.7.1 The building will face south west and south east. Its southwest face will be shielded from solar gain by the close proximity of 2 Southwark Street and the south east aspect will not be prone to strong solar gain.

- 5.7.2 In order to reduce potentially intrusive noise from trains and traffic a predominantly solid construction is proposed with punched window openings rather than fully glazed facades. High thermal installation will be provided to meet the increasing standards of the Building Regulations and sustainability requirements.

- 5.7.3 The retail uses will have their own independent plant situated on the roof. There will be a generous (3.2m) floor-to-soffit height at ground floor level and the rear section, away from the traffic noise of Borough High Street, will be fully glazed. See drawing BHS(A)13.

5.8 External Cladding

- 5.8.1 The two principal frontages to Bedale Street and Borough High Street will be clad in oolitic limestone at ground floor level, similar to No's 11-15 opposite, with a proprietary cladding system to the upper floors.

- 5.8.2 This will comprise brick panels in a stack-bonded pattern which can be pre-fabricated and hoisted into position on site. We were attracted by the precision, and high quality workmanship of this product. The contemporary use of a traditional product (clay bricks) and the rigour this design approach imposes on the building will contribute to the building quality required by the Secretary of State. There will be no cut bricks or

messy junctions. Aluminium windows will be inset into the cladding panels. Stone string courses at window cill level, zinc lined window reveals, the projecting zinc cornice, exposed lintols, curved corner windows and projecting frameless glass bay windows will provide detailed interest to the elevations. See drawing BHS(A)15.

5.8.3 The shopfronts will have aluminium framing with high level vents and low level ventilation / smoke outlets to the basement.

5.8.4 Projecting ledges at first floor level will provide opportunities for uplighting the building and the projecting soffit.

5.9 External Design

5.9.1 This end of Borough High Street will be foreshortened by the presence of the new bridge. The contribution to the character of the street provided by the long elevation of the present building cannot be reproduced as the street frontage will be reduced. The new building will therefore serve a different function. In visual terms, it will signal the end of the High Street and turn the corner into Bedale Street. Its predominantly solid form will maintain the enclosure required at this end of Borough High Street and form the visual abutment from which the bridge structure will apparently spring. It will maintain the “strong street definition and focal point in views along Borough High Street and from St Thomas Street” (the Appraisal [CD/ 235] paragraph.4.3.7) that the present buildings provide.

5.9.2 The new building will be lively and finely detailed without dominating the street scene. Nevertheless it will be a contemporary building of high quality and exceptional design. It will share a common use of zinc and stone with its complementary neighbour at 11-15 Borough High Street opposite and will pick up on the use of red brick from buildings further south. In particular, the main Borough Market building, at No. 8 Southwark Street,

has the same mix of red brick over Portland Stone, see photo 4. All these materials will weather and age gracefully over time. See photomontage BHS(A)17 and elevation drawings BHS(A)11 and BHS(A)12.

5.9.3 In his report to the LB Southwark Planning Committee held on 8 February 2005 [CD/ 240] the planning officer reported that:

“8.8 Townscape Conservation Issues

The main elevations of the buildings are considered to be of a good quality design and the general size and bulk is constant (sic) with other buildings in the vicinity. However, an assurance is needed, which could be safeguarded by the use of an appropriate planning condition, that the building’s glazed corner section is comprised of curved glass. More detailed drawings/plans will also be required.”

5.9.4 He also stated in paragraph’s 8.9 and 8.10 that the proposed uses were acceptable and that the new building would not inhibit the use of surrounding buildings.

5.9.5 He recommended that;

“Planning Permission be granted subject to appropriate conditions inter alia requiring the submission of a palette of materials and a 1:10 window profile drawing”.

5.9.6 Unfortunately the council determined (minutes of meeting, paragraph 1.5 [CD/240]);

“that were the council able to determine this application planning permission would be refused on the grounds failure to preserve or enhance the Conservation Area. That an investigation be carried out on the possibility of retaining at least part of the façade of the building in future proposals”.

5.10 Summary

- 5.10.1 The building will comply with PPG15 [CD/7] guidance and, in particular, paragraphs 2.14, 3.5, 3.19, 4.16, 4.20 and 4.26. The overall mass of the building, its scale and its contextual relationship will be in harmony with its neighbours. The facing materials will be selected from the palette of predominant materials in the area and the development will fit into the local urban grain.
- 5.10.2 It will improve the public realm by virtue of the new pedestrian routes and places created and it will improve views into Green Dragon Court, The Globe and the Southwark Cathedral precincts.
- 5.10.3 The Inspector's report [CD/199 10.6.24] refers to the need to maintain enclosure of the street and the proposed building will clearly achieve this aim.
- 5.10.4 The built form will comply with the guidance in the Appraisal [CD/ 235] (paragraph.5.2) and the broader principles of PPS1 [CD/149] for sustainable development by adding to the overall character and quality of the Borough High Street area over the lifetime of the development. It will address the needs of people to access jobs and services and will be integrated into the existing urban form.

5.11 The alternative Replacement Building – The Market Hall option

- 5.11.1 The Market Hall option was developed during pre-application consultation, and has been prepared having regard to:
- a. Objections from the Borough Market Trustees to the mixed use retail/offices building proposal.
 - b. The Borough Market Trustees' desire for an increased market area.

c. Southwark Cathedral's desire for a more visible presence of the Cathedral from Borough High Street.

5.11.2 The Market Hall and retail shop would be built following completion of the viaduct and bridge structure and would be structurally independent.

5.11.3 The Market Hall would consist of a 13m high glass wall to the Bedale Street and Borough High Street elevations, with a glass roof. Adjacent to it a retail shop would be built under the bridge, maintaining the existing street frontage on one side and abutting existing brick supports to the existing railway bridge on the other. The rear of the shop would be open to the market hall and Green Dragon Court. See drawing BHS(B)5.

5.11.4 As with the present market, there would be no security to the Market Hall trading area behind the glazed frontage.

5.11.5 Between the existing viaduct and the new viaduct a second glass roof would cover the space below. See drawing BHS(B)6.

5.12 Siting

5.12.1 The glazed wall would be built on the line of the existing buildings at no's 24 and 26 Borough High Street. A formal sliding metal gate would signal whether the new Market Hall was open for trade and this would be the principal point of access to the Market Hall for pedestrians on the High Street.

5.12.2 Secondary access would also be created at the rear, in front of The Globe, from Green Dragon Court, the Southwark Cathedral precincts and via a new route across Bedale Street from the existing Borough Market.

5.12.3 The new viaduct structure, and the glass roofs on either side, would provide protection from the elements. It is possible that the trading area would spread out into Green Dragon Court and the Green Market under the existing viaduct.

5.12.4 All vehicular deliveries of goods would be made from Bedale Street and the area to the north west of The Globe.

5.12.5 The retail shop would be triangular in plan and single-storey in height. It would have a Borough High Street frontage and access at the rear. This would allow the public to wander through the shop, which would also serve as a portal to the Southwark Cathedral precincts. Again, all deliveries would be to the rear.

5.13 Site Context

5.13.1 The Market Hall would continue to enclose the street frontage and would screen the viaduct to some extent. However, with only structural obstructions at high level, the viaduct will be partially visible from the Borough High Street.

5.13.2 The new building will be approximately 2m lower than the existing listed buildings. The visually verified rendering of the development demonstrates that the tower of Southwark Cathedral would be largely visible from Borough High Street. See photomontage BHS(B)12. It would also be possible to see over the building to the upper part of The Globe public house.

5.13.3 The retail shop would be the small partner of the Market Hall and would be sited between the abutments of the new and existing bridges.

5.13.4 The presence of a new railway bridge and wholly glazed, transparent buildings in the context of the Borough High Street Conservation Area was not anticipated when the Appraisal [CD/235] was drafted by LB Southwark in 2003. However, although the character and appearance of this part of Borough High Street would be altered by these developments I believe the Conservation Area would be enhanced. The exceptional quality of the replacement building and the vitality of market trading would not only

enhance the local environment but would also contribute to the economic regeneration of the area, in accordance with PPG15 [CD/ 7 paragraph 3.5].

5.14 Accommodation

5.14.1 The market hall would cover an area of approximately 165m² beneath the glass roof and a further 385m² under the new viaduct. At the rear the glass roof between the two viaducts would cover a further 140m² (total 690m²).

5.14.2 The retail shop would have an area of approximately 74sq.m. on one level and would be over 5m high internally.

5.15 Environmental Factors

5.15.1 The new Market Hall would not be heated. There would be power points for individual traders and the Hall would be lit with high bay industrial (metal halide) fittings. Traders would supplement this lighting with their own individual displays.

5.15.2 The ventilated façade would allow the continual free movement of air between the overlapping glass panels and there would be no rear wall to divide the Hall from the open space behind. See drawing BHS(B)13.

5.15.3 The building's lofty height and good natural ventilation will prevent an excessive build up of temperature. See drawings BHS(B)9 and BHS(B)10.

5.15.4 Some noise from passing trains and street traffic would permeate into the space, in a similar way to that which already exists in the present market.

5.15.5 The retail shop would be double glazed on both sides to reduce heat loss and to maintain comfortable internal environment. The building would have an internal height of over 5m from floor to ceiling. Air-conditioning would not be necessary, and carefully designed high level natural ventilation would provide a good working and shopping environment.

5.16 External Cladding

- 5.16.1 The Market Hall would have an exposed, external steel structure with circular columns at approx. 4.52m centres. These would support a mono-pitched glass roof and a system of overlapping single glazed toughened glass panels on cladding rails which would keep out the elements but allow permanent natural ventilation along their edges. Over 90% of the glass panels would be the same size and would be simply fixed to the frame.
- 5.16.2 A 4m high steel gate with the Borough Market Trustees' seal would slide across the opening in the glass wall to provide public access from the street.
- 5.16.3 Steel trusses would support the glass roof structure over the Hall and a similar structure between the viaducts would support the glass roof to this section.
- 5.16.4 Cleaning of the glass, internally and externally, would be carried out with a cherry picker platform hoist.
- 5.16.5 Opportunities would exist for signing the building with large etched or printed graphics applied directly to the glass panels on Bedale Street/ Borough High Street elevations. At night the structure would be illuminated and lighting from individual trader's displays would filter onto Borough High Street, creating an attractive glow and contribute to its vitality.
- 5.16.6 The retail shop would also be fully glazed but with a proprietary curtain wall system with sealed double-glazed units.

5.17 External Design

- 5.17.1 The Market Hall structure would echo the 19th Century Market Hall structures of Borough Market. It is a 21st Century version of this established building type, with a vertical rhythm set up by the columns and balanced with horizontal lines of cladding. See drawings BHS(B)7 and BHS(B)8.
- 5.17.2 Its little brother, the retail shop, would sit neatly alongside it under the bridge, providing light and interest to an area that might otherwise be dark and dingy.
- 5.17.3 The total area covered by the Market Hall structure would be approximately 690sq.m. - quite large by Borough High Street standards - and would be well integrated into the urban fabric.
- 5.17.4 The design allows improved views of Southwark Cathedral tower from Borough High Street. See photomontage BHS(B)12.
- 5.17.5 The movement of trains across the bridge and viaduct would be more visible than would otherwise be with the alternative mixed use building proposed.

5.18 Summary

- 5.18.1 Together with the new bridge and the redevelopment at 11-15 Borough High Street, the new Market Hall and shop would substantially change the nature of this part of the Conservation Area. But, by maintaining a sense of enclosure and bringing market activities back to Borough High Street, its character and appearance would be enhanced.

5.18.2 The proposals comply with the guidelines for new development contained in the Appraisal [CD/235], paragraphs 5.2.7 to 5.2.11, and undoubtedly improve the public realm.

5.18.3 The Market Hall and retail shop would comply with PPG15 [CD/7] paragraphs 2.14, 3.5, 3.19, 4.16, 4.20 and 4.26. The Market Hall building's mass would sit comfortably between 2 Southwark Street and the new bridge structure and would successfully mediate between the two styles. Improved views of the Southwark Cathedral tower would also be a welcome introduction to the street scene.

5.19 Planning Application

5.19.1 A planning application for the Market Hall and shop at no's 16-26 Borough High Street was made on 18 July 2005 [CD/241 and CD/242].

6.0 2-4 BEDALE STREET

6.1 Existing Building

- 6.1.1 See drawings BM7, BM8, BM9, BM10 and BM11.
- 6.1.2 No's. 1 to 3 Bedale Street comprise three properties built as a terrace in the 1930's. No. 4 Bedale Street is a late Victorian four-storey building which survives between the 1930's buildings at 1, 2, 3 and 5 Bedale Street.
- 6.1.3 All buildings have retail uses at ground floor and basement level, with storage, residential and ancillary office uses above. All four properties are separately occupied. The proposal is to demolish no's 2 to 4 Bedale Street, (leaving no. 1 standing).
- 6.1.4 The Appraisal [CD/235] shows the group of buildings on the southwest side of Bedale Street as buildings that make a positive contribution to the Conservation Area (figure 41, page 40). In paragraph 4.3.1 it states that:
- “the main defining elements of the Conservation Area are groups of buildings that combine into frontages that define street, spaces and views. Often this group value of buildings is as important as the individual characteristics of listed buildings and the scale, containment and background character that they provide is essential to the character of the Conservation Area”.
- None of the buildings are listed. (See photomontage BM20)
- 6.1.5 Apart from this general statement, which characterises the Conservation Area as a whole, No's 1 to 4 Bedale Street are not mentioned in the section of the Appraisal [CD/235] which describes “The Character and Appearance of the Area in Sub Area 1 – Borough High Street. North of Southwark Street”. None of the buildings on the southwest side of Bedale Street are specifically referred to in the Appraisal.

6.1.6 Almost all of the buildings in the Conservation Area are described in the Appraisal as making a positive contribution but no specific reference is made to the contribution that the group of buildings at 1 to 4 Bedale Street makes to the Conservation Area. I therefore conclude that their contribution is limited to the “scale, containment and background character that they provide’, being ‘essential to the character of the Conservation Area” (paragraph 4.3.1). There is nothing in the Appraisal to suggest it is the intrinsic architectural qualities of the individual buildings themselves that make positive contributions to the Conservation Area [photograph 7, Appendix 2, NR/5/B]

6.1.7 The Inspector at the first inquiry did not comment in his report upon the quality or importance of the buildings to be demolished at 2 to 4 Bedale Street other than to voice general concern about the “impacts (of the Thameslink 2000 proposals) in other discreet areas to the west of Borough High Street” ([CD/199] paragraph 45.8.8). He stated in paragraph 10.6.30 that:

“reinstatement of buildings fronting Bedale Street would maintain the sense of enclosure and permit the re-establishment of small businesses which are important to the character of the area and provide employment. In my view the proposal would preserve the character of this part of the Conservation Area”.

6.2 The Proposed Replacement building

6.2.1 Railtrack’s requirements for this site, following the Thameslink 2000 Inquiry Inspector’s report [CD/199], was that reinstatement of these buildings should maintain the sense of enclosure of the existing buildings and permit the reestablishment of small businesses which are important to the character of the area. The replacement building requires to fit beneath and around the sides of the new viaduct. It should provide retail facilities at ground floor level and office facilities at first floor level. It is likely that no other commercially usable areas will be practicable. Discussions with LB

Southwark and English Heritage have referred to the possibility of providing a new access route to the Borough Market on the site. Consideration will have to be given to sources of funding of the construction and ongoing maintenance of any such access route.

6.3 Siting

6.3.1 The replacement buildings will be built on the site of the demolished buildings, occupying the same footprint. See drawing BM6.

6.3.2 The four-storey building at no.4 Bedale Street lies directly in the path of the viaduct and the three upper floors would need to be demolished to make way for it. No's 2 and 3 Bedale Street are underneath the new viaduct. Demolition of the first floor would be necessary. We concluded that total re-building of no's 2 to 4 would result in a higher quality development in comparison with the adaption and re-facing of the remnants of the existing buildings that would remain.

6.3.3 It will be possible, however, to retain no's 1 and 5 Bedale Street. These are two architecturally similar buildings that will frame the replacement structure.

6.3.4 However, whereas the buildings to be demolished are in four separate occupancies, it is intended that the replacement building will comprise one or two tenancies, with a new separate pedestrian entrance to Borough Market at no. 2 Bedale Street. It is intended that the ground and basement floors of the replacement building will be used for retail purposes with ancillary storage. The first floor could be let separately for office use or combined with the retail use at ground floor level. See drawings BM13 and BM14.

6.3.5 If the building is occupied by a market trader, deliveries and servicing will be made at the rear of the building from Borough Market. If not, servicing will take place from Bedale Street.

6.3.6 It is intended that the gateway into the Borough Market would be controlled by the Market Trustees, although no formal discussion has yet taken place about this matter.

6.4 Site Context

6.4.1 The site is opposite The Globe, a Grade II listed building. On either side of the replacement building will be the remaining parts of the 1930's buildings at no. 1 and 5 Bedale Street. Adjoining no. 1 Bedale Street is the five-storey building at no. 2 Southwark Street, which turns the corner into Borough High Street and, next to no. 5 Bedale Street, is the existing railway viaduct structure.

6.4.2 The new viaduct will cross Bedale Street over the central section of the replacement building at first floor level. See photomontage BM21.

6.4.3 The architectural styles of the neighbouring buildings range from the Victorian public house, The Globe (Grade II listed), to decorated splendour at 2 Southwark Street and 1930's art deco at no's 1 and 5 Bedale Street [photograph 7, Appendix 2, NR/5/B]. Storey heights vary from three to five floors and all buildings rise directly from their street frontages. The enclosed alleyway nature of Bedale Street widens into Green Dragon Court beyond the curved façade of the Globe. The site, and Bedale Street in front of it, will be largely covered by the new viaduct structure with two supporting columns adjacent to The Globe.

6.4.4 The Bedale Street frontage of the replacement building at 24 to 26 Borough High Street will also be diagonally opposite the site. To the rear, the

building faces directly into Borough Market, a covered space over two storeys high.

6.4.5 This disparate collection of buildings contributes liveliness to the urban scene, particularly at street level, and is held together by a rhythm and diversity that denies monotony.

6.4.6 The replacement building will fit into this context by reproducing the vertical rhythm of the existing buildings and by using similar facing materials. Fascias and shop signs by the tenant(s) replicate the variety that currently exists at street level.

6.5 Accommodation

6.5.1 See drawings BMI2, BMI3, BMI4, BMI5, BMI6, BMI7, BMI8 and BMI9.

6.5.2 The proposed building will consist of ground and basement floors for retail purposes comprising 133sq.m. at basement level and 94sq.m. at ground floor level. At first floor level will be 133sq.m. of space for further retail or office use. The total net area of the building will therefore be 360sq.m.

6.5.3 Above first floor level there will be a deck for signalling equipment associated with the new viaduct. Part of the first floor, over no. 4 Bedale Street, will be a double height space to reflect the taller building adjacent to no. 5 Bedale Street.

6.5.4 A single staircase at the rear connects all three floors, with lobbies at ground floor level to comply with the Building Regulations. Toilets are provided at ground and first floor levels. 'Soft' spots will be incorporated into the ground and first floor slabs for platform lifts to be installed for the use of mobility impaired persons, in compliance with the Building Regulations and the Disability Discrimination Act.

6.5.5 The building has been designed with flexibility in mind and will be completed to a 'shell only' finish at ground and basement levels to allow fitting out by the tenant to his own requirements. The first floor will be completed to a basic offices specification with a raised floor and suspended ceiling.

6.5.6 Heating and ventilation plant will be sited at basement and roof level to suit the occupier's requirements. The building will be naturally ventilated, primarily with opening windows to Bedale Street. Glazed doors can be opened inwards at first floor level.

6.6 Environmental Factors

6.6.1 The building will be shielded from solar gain by the oversailing viaduct and northeast facing elevation. Consequently, a simple heating system and natural ventilation will be able to maintain a comfortable internal environment.

6.6.2 Some noise penetration from trains passing over the existing and proposed viaducts is possible. Double-glazed windows, glass blocks, and dense masonry construction will provide some reduction of noise intrusion.

6.7 External Design

6.7.1 See drawings BM16 and BM20.

6.7.2 Bedale Street is a working street with small traders and specialist shops. The new building will affect the setting of the listed building, The Globe, opposite.

6.7.3 The principal elevation of the replacement building reflects its modest nature. It is the direct expression of an unpretentious language of assembly, with brick-framed enclosures of relatively large window openings and a

modest stone-faced building marking a new entrance to Borough Market. See drawing BMI6. No. 2 Bedale Street, the entrance to the Borough Market, echoes the Portland stone facing to the building at no.8 Southwark Street which fronts the market. It will have steel gates to control entry and incised lettering to mark the entrance. Narrow profile steel windows at first floor level will be similar to those in the Borough Market offices.

- 6.7.4 Set well back from the street frontage at roof level will be a zinc-clad enclosure for signalling equipment associated with the new viaduct structure.
- 6.7.5 No. 3 Bedale Street will be a double bay structure under the new viaduct with columns at approximately 5m. centres, similar to the party wall centres of the existing buildings. The brick cladding will be similar to the brick cladding on the existing buildings, with steel-framed windows at first floor level and aluminium-framed shop fronts below.
- 6.7.6 No. 4 Bedale Street will have the appearance of a three-storey building in order to conceal the side of the new viaduct and to maintain the tight 'alleyway' nature of Bedale Street. It will also hide the flank wall of no. 5 Bedale Street, which would otherwise become exposed with the demolition of the existing four-storey building at no. 4 Bedale Street. It will be, however, part of the two storey structure that will extend across no's. 2 and 4 Bedale Street. See drawing BMI4. No. 4 Bedale Street will be clad in London stock brickwork, similar to the building it replaces, with double-height steel-framed windows and an aluminium framed shop front at street level.
- 6.7.7 In a letter dated 20 January 2004 [CD/ 206] to the Government Office of London, LB Southwark stated that it "recommends that planning permission is granted" for this development.

6.7.8 LB Southwark considered this application again in 2005 when the planning officer, in his report to the Planning Committee meeting on 8th February 2005, recommended that planning permission be granted subject to conditions, were the Council able to determine the application. (paragraph. 4.1 [CD/ 239]).

6.7.9 In paragraph 6.6 the officer endorsed the Inspector's view stated in paragraph 10.6.30 of his report, commenting that "the current proposal represents a full reinstatement proposal to this end."

6.7.10 In paragraph. 8.6 he states that:

"the proposed buildings are considered to be, in principle, an appropriate design response as they would re-provide a distinct semi-industrial building appropriate to the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. In particular, the additional route to the Borough Market through the site of no. 2 Bedale Street takes cognizance of the historic street pattern in the area. Notwithstanding the modern design and materials the proposed building manages to reflect the historic precedents of the surrounding built environment. However, greater detail is requested to enable the Council's full support."

6.7.11 In paragraph. 8.7 he adds that:

"It is considered that the proposed building could preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Borough High Street Conservation Area".

6.7.12 Unfortunately, it was resolved by the Committee (minutes of meeting, paragraph 1.3 [CD/239]):

"that were the council able to determine this application planning permission would be refused on the grounds of failure to preserve or enhance the Conservation Area".

6.8 Summary

- 6.8.1 The replacement building will echo the modest nature of the buildings it replaces. It will perform the same urban functions as its predecessors but with an improved public realm – the new pedestrian entrance to the market – and larger retail/office spaces more attuned to 21st century requirements.
- 6.8.2 The new buildings will leave the listed building setting of The Globe public house opposite unharmed. It is the oversailing effect of the new viaduct that will produce the most imposing change to this area. See photomontage BM21.
- 6.8.3 By replicating the existing footprint, character and uses of the existing buildings the new development complies with the guidance contained in PPG15 [CD/7], in particular paragraphs 2.14, 2.17, 4.16 and 4.20. The development makes a positive contribution to the Conservation Area by improving routes through the site to Borough Market and leaves its appearance unharmed.
- 6.8.4 The development achieves the objectives of PPS1 [CD/149], in particular paragraphs 35 and 36.

7.0 7 STONEY STREET SEI

7.1 Existing Buildings

- 7.1.1 See drawings BM2 and BM3. The existing building is an empty four storey 19th Century building, which was previously used as a ground floor shop with storage or offices over. It is currently boarded up and disused. It has a very small open area at the rear. The building adjoins Grade II Listed buildings at no's 5 and 6 Stoney Street. [photograph 8, Appendix 2, NR/5/B].
- 7.1.2 The proposal is to demolish the existing building and create a small open space, which is intended to be used as a beer garden by The Wheatsheaf public house, and to construct an open staircase in connection with maintenance of the new viaduct.
- 7.1.3 In his report [CD/199] the Inspector referred to the "loss of heritage" caused by the partial demolition of no. 8 Stoney Street, the total demolition of no. 7 Stoney Street and the removal of the upper floor of The Wheatsheaf public house. (paragraph 10.6.31) He did not, however, make specific reference to the architectural qualities of no. 7 Stoney Street.
- 7.1.4 In his report to the LB Southwark Planning Committee on 8 February 2005 [CD/238] the planning officer confined consideration of the application to "merely determine the acceptability of the beer garden itself" and made no comment on the architectural qualities of the building to be demolished. (paragraph 6.5).
- 7.1.5 Factors which were taken into account by ourselves in consideration of the need to demolish the existing building were its structural condition, the need for demolition as a result of the intervention of the new viaduct and the effect upon setting of the adjacent listed buildings.

7.1.6 The need for demolition arises as a result of the imposition of the new viaduct upon the existing building. The construction of the viaduct will cause the demolition of the upper three floors of the building leaving a ground floor remnant. See drawing BM3.

7.1.7 In view of its poor structural condition we concluded that it was impracticable to retain any part of the existing building and that replacement proposals would be likely to yield worthwhile improvements to the street scene and enhancement of the appearance of the Conservation Area.

7.2 The Proposed Replacement

7.2.1 Railtrack's requirement for this site, following the Thameslink 2000 Inquiry Inspector's report, was that it is inappropriate for construction of a replacement building (because of the use of part of it for an abutment supporting the new railway viaduct) and has been identified for use, subject to a decision by the Corporation of Wardens to lease it, as a "beer garden" for the adjoining "Wheatsheaf public house. Enclosure of the space (for reasons of security and appearance) with gates will be required.

7.2.2 Following demolition of the existing building the site will be used for construction of the viaduct, including the large concrete abutment and piled foundations at the rear of the site. See drawing BM4. Adaptations will be made to The Wheatsheaf public house and openings made into a small landscaped area on the site of no. 7 Stoney Street.

7.2.3 A steel staircase providing access to the viaduct structure will be enclosed in stainless steel mesh for security reasons. This is a high quality woven mesh that will not rust and is sufficiently closely woven to prevent litter from being pushed through. It will appear as an opaque shaft rising from street level, three storeys high.

- 7.2.4 It is intended that the beer garden will be fitted out by the publican. It will be largely covered by the viaduct structure and will therefore be suitable for use all year round.
- 7.2.5 It is intended that the sculptural metal gate proposed will be designed and fabricated by a local metalworker, who could be selected by competition. Its function is to provide access and security whilst allowing a visual connection between the street and the beer garden behind. See drawing BM3.
- 7.2.6 Our design, of 'long waving grass', is purely indicative to provide a suitable basis for a design acceptable to the various stakeholders. We envisage it will be fabricated in stainless steel or cast aluminium to provide a high quality enclosure to improve the public realm and to comply with PPG 15 [CD/7] guidance by improving the setting of listed buildings at no's 5 and 6 Stoney Street (paragraph. 2.17), to allow the area to remain alive and prosperous (paragraph. 4.16) and to contribute positively to the area's character and appearance. (paragraph. 4.20).

7.3 Summary

- 7.3.1 The Appraisal [CD/ 235] makes specific reference to 5-7 Stoney Street in the Audit section, paragraph. 4.3.3, as being a group of buildings:
- “that combine into frontages that define streets spaces and views. Often this group value of buildings is as important as the individual characteristics of listed buildings, and the scale, containment and background character that they provide is essential to the character of the Conservation Area.” (paragraph. 4.3.1).
- 7.3.2 At the LB Southwark Planning Committee on 8 February 2005 the Committee resolved that, “were the Council able to determine this application planning permission would be granted” (minutes of meeting, paragraph. 1.4[CD/238]).

- 7.3.3 The Beer Garden proposals will sit comfortably in the street scene and are complementary to existing uses. There is enhancement of the existing townscape by virtue of improvements to the public realm and the design fits comfortably into the local 'grain' of the Conservation Area.
- 7.3.4 The provisions and guidance contained in PPS1 [CD/149 paragraphs 33 to 39] for 'Design' are complied with and the specific guidance in 'By Design' [CD/236] will result in improvements to place-making and the quality of the public realm.
- 7.3.5 I therefore believe that these proposals will preserve and enhance the special character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area.

8.0 OVERVIEW

8.1 The Urban Context

8.1.1 The northern part of the Borough High Street Conservation Area is characterised by the impact of railway architecture. The existing Victorian viaduct threads its way between and over buildings ranging from 18th century Georgian houses to large 19th century market hall structures and a few 20th century infill buildings.

8.1.2 Recent developments are remarkably few and limited to single-storey restaurants and the re-construction of a 19th century market building (the Floral Hall).

8.1.3 The new Thameslink 2000 viaduct will intensify the existing character of the area; the new replacement buildings will add to the variety of buildings that typify this part of the Conservation Area.

8.1.4 The Appraisal [CD/235], paragraph. 3.1.14 states that:

“In the north of the Conservation Area, the brick arches and steel bridge structures of the railway line have an imposing effect on its character. They create a high degree of enclosures and a heavy weight of engineering detailing. Against their dark solidarity, the brightness and liveliness of market activity, pub and shop fronts, goods for sale and hanging flower baskets make vibrant and colourful contrasts.”

This is an apt description of the area.

8.1.5 Similar to the Victorian pioneering ambitions of the 1860's, the new viaduct and bridge structures will bring 21st century engineering techniques to Borough Market and Borough High Street. The adaption of existing buildings and the design of new replacement buildings will intensify the existing character of the Conservation Area.

8.2 Our Approach

8.2.1 To meet the challenge of designing replacement buildings which will add to the richness and vitality of the area, we assembled a team of five architects to develop designs for each of the sites. Each architect was briefed on the requirements for his or her site and the work was carried out under the control and direction of an Associate of the practice (Tony Ling) and myself as Director.

8.2.2 Individual approaches to each site were allowed to flower, with co-ordination and control being executed by Tony Ling and myself. In this way we were able to create a variety of architectural responses to the requirements, which echo the variety of buildings that characterise the area. In this way we strived to avoid the dead hand of monotony descending onto the route of the viaduct; we wished to continue the tradition of diversity which is the very essence of the area.

8.3 Our proposals

8.3.1 The proposed buildings are not iconic structures which aim to make large statements but are invariably designed to 'fit in' with their immediate context. They will provide a well-mannered response to the unique challenge of bringing a large scale viaduct and bridge structure to this historic part of London and fully comply with the guidance contained in Government policy documents including PPS1 [CD/149], PPG15 [CD/7] and 'By Design'[CD/236].

8.3.2 We believe the proposals will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Borough High Street Conservation Area

8.3.3 I therefore respectfully suggest that the Inspector and the Secretaries of State should give consent for the Thameslink 2000 proposals.